

<b>ISLE OF ANGLESEY COUNTY COUNCIL</b>	
<b>Report to:</b>	<b>Full Council</b>
<b>Date:</b>	<b>September 2015</b>
<b>Subject:</b>	<b>Provision of Free Breakfast Clubs in Primary Schools</b>
<b>Portfolio Holder(s):</b>	<b>Coun. Kenneth Hughes</b>
<b>Head of Service:</b>	<b>Delyth Molyneux</b>
<b>Report Author:</b> Tel: E-mail:	<b>Gareth Jones</b> <b>01248 752947</b> <b>dgjed@anglesey.gov.uk</b>
<b>Local Members:</b>	<b>Relevant to all members</b>

<b>A –Recommendation/s and reason/s</b>
<p>The Task and Finish Group set up by the Council recommends -</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Schools to run a fee paying pre-school care club between 8.00 and 8.25. Schools to then run a free breakfast club between 8.25 and 8.50. These clubs to be distinct from each other and attendance at the pre school club is not a requirement for attendance at the breakfast club.</li> <li>2. This recommendation to be consulted upon with the stakeholders in a similar way to the previous consultation e.g. use of surveymonkey and correspondence with Governing Bodies. This to be done as the recommendation outlined above was not an option outlined as part of the original consultation.</li> <li>3. The new arrangements, if approved, to be implemented in September 2016. If the on-line payment system is available by April 2016, the new arrangements to be implemented from the beginning of the summer term, April 2016.</li> <li>4. The Task and Finish Group to continue as a monitoring and standards group for the new arrangements.</li> </ol> <p>Details for the proposed arrangements are</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Current staff employed under the Free Breakfast Scheme to continue as they are employed for one hour under existing arrangements; 7.50 to 8.50.</li> </ul>

- The fee to be set at 75p per day per child for the pre school care club. If a family has three or more children attending the pre school care club then the fee to be set at £2 per day for the family.
- The Authority will put in place a system for the collection of fees electronically. Any cash collected will need to be banked within the school's usual banking arrangements.
- There will be no change in Caterlink's role as the provider of the breakfasts.
- The Authority will have to consider the effect on the need for registration with CSSIW on an individual school basis as registration is required if the school runs a pre school and after school club for a total of more than two hours in one day. There is no cost involved with CSSIW registration.

The Task and Finish Group recommends this option as:

- It continues to provide children with a free breakfast at the start of the school day and delivers on a Welsh Government priority.
- It provides families with a pre school care club to facilitate work arrangements. This was a significant factor for families in using the Free Breakfast Clubs. 60% of respondents said they used the provision for child care and of these 92% said it was to facilitate their work arrangements.
- It provides income for the Council to set against budgetary considerations as the cost of the provision at present is £398,000 and set to rise by at least £20,000 under the adoption of the new Pay and Grading Structure .Based on 14/15 take up figures the income generated is estimated at £176,130 if all pupils attend the pre school care club. If 75% of those pupils who attend the breakfast club also attend the pre school care club then £132,098 will be generated. This falls to £88,065 if there is 50% take up and to £44,033 if there is 25% take up.
- 10 out of 21 Governing Bodies who expressed a preference chose this option (48%).

**B – What other options did you consider and why did you reject them and/or opt for this option?**

1. Change supervisors employment from an hour to half an hour with the club running from 8.30 to 8.50.

This was rejected as an inherent risk as supervisors would be unwilling to undertake a cut, creating difficulties in recruiting new staff. The savings would also only be in the region of £87,000 for a full year.

2. Cut employment of supervisors and arrange volunteers.(but not in the kitchen).

This was rejected as being unworkable in terms of recruiting volunteers and keeping them. It would increase head teacher workload which is unacceptable as a way forward, in light of

difficulties recruiting head teachers.

3. Governing Bodies to withdraw from the scheme and join the Clwb Bore Bach.

This was rejected as the response of stakeholders through surveymonkey displayed opposition to the idea. This would also entail families paying for a breakfast which is not in line with Welsh Government guidance.

4. Governing Bodies to arrange own school scheme by receiving delegated finance.

This was rejected as no Governing Body expressed an interest in this option due to the resulting increase in beaurocracy.

**C – Why is this a decision for the Full Council?**

This is a decision which the Executive Committee has decided should be taken as a Council.

**CH – Is this decision consistent with policy approved by the Council?**

This recommendation still allows the continuation of the provision of a free breakfast for primary pupils before the start of the school day.

**D – Is this decision within the budget approved by the Council?**

The Council has set a budget for the provision of the Free Breakfast Scheme.

<b>DD – Who did you consult?</b>		<b>What did they say?</b>
<b>1</b>	<b>Chief Executive / Strategic Leadership Team (SLT)</b> (mandatory)	Supportive of the proposal to try to implement by April 2016. The reason for this suggestion is twofold – the possibility that an ICT based payment system could be installed by April and the need to maximise financial savings in view of the present budget constraints.
<b>2</b>	<b>Finance / Section 151</b> (mandatory)	Finance have been involved in developing this report and has no further comment to make.
<b>3</b>	<b>Legal / Monitoring Officer</b>	Suggestions made to clarify Paragraph C in

	(mandatory)	report –this has been actioned.
4	<b>Human Resources (HR)</b>	No comments from HR about the recommendations, current staff contracts remain the same as they are currently employed.
5	<b>Property</b>	
6	<b>Information Communication Technology (ICT)</b>	
7	<b>Scrutiny</b>	
8	<b>Local Members</b>	
9	<b>Any external bodies / other/s</b>	Governors, head teachers, CAB and Lleisiau Lleol propose this option as a result of the conclusions of their Task and Finish Group.

<b>E – Risks and any mitigation (if relevant)</b>		
1	<b>Economic</b>	No comments
2	<b>Anti-poverty</b>	The favoured option continues to ensure free school breakfast for all pupils.
3	<b>Crime and Disorder</b>	
4	<b>Environmental</b>	
5	<b>Equalities</b>	
6	<b>Outcome Agreements</b>	
7	<b>Other</b>	

<b>F - Appendices:</b>
<p>1. Breakfast Club Parent Consultation Report May 2015.</p> <p>2. Governors Response.</p>

<b>FF - Background papers (please contact the author of the Report for any further information):</b>

## **Breakfast Club Report**

Report from the results of the survey circulated to parents of children in primary schools across Anglesey.

The survey was to look at options available to the schools that currently offer a free Breakfast club provision, but need to review the situation in light of service cuts, yet ensuring a quality provision for those families who need it.

The survey was circulated in different formats. As a paper copy through the primary schools, as electronic copies promoted via Facebook, twitter and collated through surveymonkey.

### **Current Situation**

Over the coming months, the Council will have to make decisions about how to reduce the amount it spends on services up to the value of £15m. This includes looking at the budget for Education. This means that the council will have to balance the need for cutting current budgets with raising the standards in the classroom, whilst minimising the impact of budget cuts on a schools' budget.

One area for possible discussion is that of breakfast clubs, which currently cost £385,000 to run. At this point in time, Breakfast Club is run free of charge in 46 of the 47 primary schools on Anglesey. This is a service that the Council must provide where the school governors have asked them to do so, when there is no "reasonable reason to refuse", and where the Breakfast Club has already been running since 2013. However the money provided by the Welsh Government to run the clubs is not kept separately within the overall council budget and could be used to pay for other services that the Council provides. It is because the Breakfast Clubs are funded by this pot of money from the Welsh Government that the County Council are unable to charge a fee. The Council will only make arrangements for a free Breakfast Club if the schools' Governing Body requests one. The Council however has the right to stop that provision where it judges that it is "unreasonable" to do so. There is no definition of "unreasonable", but a wide range of factors can be considered including the cost of the service, and the numbers of children using the club.

As an alternative to the existing free Breakfast Club scheme, the Council is now looking at options for a new scheme for primary schools, an early morning club "Clwb Bore Bach". One suggested option is for this new club to be open from 8:00 am – 8:50 am offering a preschool care club with a healthy breakfast as part of the provision. The club would be free for all pupils who are eligible for free school meals. The club would not make a profit, but a fee would be charged for the service to make sure it was sustainable, for instance £1 per child per morning. To make sure costs to families are kept at a minimum, no individual family would be expected to pay more than £12:50 a week in total for their childrens' club.

For the scheme to go ahead, the Governing Bodies of every school would need to agree. The Council would still be contributing to the scheme, with all pupils eligible for free school meals still attending the club for free. Parental contributions would help to make sure that the overall cost to the Council would be less than it is now, (up to 50% of the current budget), which would reduce the cuts to other areas of the Education budget.

## **Overview of Responses**

There was a fantastic response to this survey, with 1,035 responses gained, and the use of social media has played a huge role in this participation, with over 83% as a result of a Facebook post. The number of responses only equates to the number of families, as some respondents have a number of children attending, but only returned one survey.

With 799 of the respondents having children of primary school age, and of these, only 10.49% eligible for free school meals.

There were 1,000 responses to the question of how respondents travelled to school, but this increased number of responses was as a result of multiple answers from individuals. Noticeably, use of a private car was the highest response with over 52%, followed by those who walk to school coming in at 37%. 27 respondents used school transport to travel to school.

80% of respondents attended their catchment school.

Almost 93% of respondents attend breakfast club at their school, and 59% use the service for childcare, whilst 10 children have to use the service as the school transport arrives at school too early. 61 respondents use the service for their children to access a breakfast to enable a reduction in household costs.

93% of those who use the service as childcare do so to access work, which equates to 406 of all respondents.

As to the costs or ability to pay for the service, it was very close between those who responded that a charge of 80p - £1:00 would be acceptable, at 30%, while 32% indicated that any charge would have a significant impact on the household budget.

34% of respondents thought they would have to reduce the number of hours worked, or cease employment if a charge for the breakfast service was introduced, 27% indicated "other" as a response, and suggested ideas such as a lower charge, some were willing to pay, but 14% thought they would have to reduce essential spending, while 13.46% suggested they would have breakfast at home. Many respondents have no alternatives available to them, and feel as they have no choice but to accept the charge.

## Respondents

**Total responses were 1,035**

Of which completed:

<b>English</b>	<b>81.29 %</b>	<b>821</b>
<b>Welsh</b>	<b>18.71%</b>	<b>189</b>
<b>Totals:</b>		<b>1,010</b>

Format of responses

<b>Paper based responses (manual entry)</b>	<b>14.11%</b>	<b>146</b>
<b>Facebook response</b>	<b>83.19%</b>	<b>861</b>
<b>Other promotion (direct website responses)</b>	<b>2.42%</b>	<b>25</b>
<b>Totals:</b>		<b>1,035</b>

**Q2 Please confirm you have children of primary school age**

<b>Yes</b>	<b>89.98%</b>	<b>799</b>
<b>No</b>	<b>10.02%</b>	<b>89</b>
<b>Totals:</b>		<b>888</b>

**Q3 Are your children eligible for free school meals?**

<b>Yes</b>	<b>10.49%</b>	<b>83</b>
<b>No</b>	<b>89.51%</b>	<b>708</b>
<b>Totals:</b>		<b>791</b>

**Q4 How do your children travel to school? (please tick all that apply)**

<b>Walk</b>	<b>37.8%</b>	<b>378</b>
<b>Bike</b>	<b>6.1%</b>	<b>61</b>
<b>Private Car</b>	<b>52.2%</b>	<b>522</b>
<b>Official school transport e.g. bus/ taxi/ mini bus</b>	<b>2.7%</b>	<b>27</b>
<b>Public transport / taxi arranged privately</b>	<b>1.2%</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>Totals:</b>		<b>1000*</b>

\*Multiple responses from respondents

**Q5 Are your children attending the local catchment school?**

<b>Yes</b>	<b>80.48%</b>	<b>643</b>
<b>No</b>	<b>19.52%</b>	<b>156</b>
<b>Totals:</b>		<b>799</b>

**Q6 Do your children attend the breakfast club?**

<b>Yes</b>	<b>92.82%</b>	<b>737</b>
<b>No</b>	<b>7.18%</b>	<b>57</b>
<b>Totals:</b>		<b>794</b>

**Q7 Why do your children attend the breakfast club?**

<b>Breakfast (to reduce household expenditure)</b>	<b>8.33%</b>	<b>61</b>
<b>Social reasons</b>	<b>10.93%</b>	<b>80</b>
<b>Childcare</b>	<b>58.88%</b>	<b>431</b>
<b>Other (please specify)</b>	<b>21.86%</b>	<b>160</b>
<b>Total:</b>		<b>732</b>

Of the "others" recorded

<b>Health / mental health</b>	<b>2.67%</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>Social</b>	<b>12.67%</b>	<b>19</b>
<b>Transport (inc school transport)</b>	<b>6.67%</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>Work</b>	<b>71.33%</b>	<b>107</b>
<b>Other / no response</b>	<b>6.67%</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>Total:</b>		<b>150</b>

**Q8 Please tell us why you require childcare?**

<b>Employment</b>	<b>92.27%</b>	<b>406</b>
<b>Education</b>	<b>4.09%</b>	<b>18</b>
<b>Volunteering</b>	<b>0.68%</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Other caring responsibilities</b>	<b>1.36%</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>Other (please specify)</b>	<b>1.59%</b>	<b>7*</b>
<b>Total:</b>		<b>440</b>

\*No responses indicated



**Q9. If a charge was introduced under a new scheme what could you reasonably afford to pay?**

<b>80p-£1 a day per child (up to the £12.50 cap)</b>	<b>30.08%</b>	<b>219</b>
<b>£1.00-£1.20 a day per child (up to the £12.50 cap)</b>	<b>7.28%</b>	<b>53</b>
<b>£1.20-£1.40 a day per child (up to the £12.50 cap)</b>	<b>4.81%</b>	<b>35</b>
<b>Any charge would significantly impact on household budget</b>	<b>31.87%</b>	<b>232</b>
<b>I/We cannot afford to pay for breakfast club</b>	<b>25.96%</b>	<b>189</b>
<b>Total:</b>		<b>728</b>

**Q10 Please tell us what options you would consider if the charge was introduced (please tick all that apply)**

<b>Alternative arrangements for childcare e.g. neighbour, friend</b>	<b>22.81%</b>	<b>190</b>
<b>Reduce non essential spending e.g. leisure , holidays etc</b>	<b>16.93%</b>	<b>141</b>
<b>Consider reducing hour/ ceasing employment</b>	<b>33.61%</b>	<b>280</b>
<b>Other (please specify)</b>	<b>26.65%</b>	<b>222</b>
<b>Total:</b>		<b>833</b>

Responses to “others”

<b>Breakfast at Home</b>	<b>13.46%</b>	<b>28</b>
<b>Arrival time governed by school transport or employment at the school</b>	<b>3.37%</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>Reduce essential spending</b>	<b>14.42%</b>	<b>30</b>
<b>Reduce employment / education or cease</b>	<b>7.21%</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>Stop going to breakfast club / eat at home</b>	<b>8.17%</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>Will Pay</b>	<b>30.77%</b>	<b>64</b>
<b>No response</b>	<b>13.94%</b>	<b>29</b>
<b>Uncategorised</b>	<b>8.65%</b>	<b>18</b>
<b>Total:</b>		<b>208</b>



**Cynllun Brecwast am Ddim, Gorffennaf 2015.**

**Free Breakfast Scheme, July 2015.**

Gofynnwyd i Gyrrff Llywodraethol ystyried yr opsiynau canlynol gan hysbysu'r Awdurdod o'r un sydd fwyaf ffafriol iddynt fel Corff. Mae'r tabl yn dangos yr ymatebion a dderbyniwyd.

*Governing Bodies were asked to consider the following options and to inform the Authority of the option that was most favoured by them as the Body. The table shows the responses received.*

Nifer ysgolion ymatebodd / *Number of schools responding* – 25 (54%)

Nifer yn methu ymateb oherwydd diffyg cworwm / *Number who could not respond because of no quorum* – 1.

Nifer yn datgan mai penderfyniad yr Awdurdod yw / *Number who stated that it is an Authority decision* – 2.

Nifer am gadw at y cynllun fel ac y mae / *Number to stay with the scheme as it is* – 1

<b><u>Opsiwn</u></b>	<b><u>Disgrifiad</u></b>	<b><u>Nifer ymatebion</u></b>	<b><u>%</u></b>
<b><u>Option</u></b>	<b><u>Description</u></b>	<b><u>Number of responses</u></b>	
1	Cadw at y cynllun presennol OND / <i>Keep to the present scheme BUT</i>		
1a	Newid cyflogaeth o awr i hanner awr gyda'r clwb yn rhedeg o 8.30 i 8.50.  <i>Change employment from an hour to half an hour with the club running from 8.30 to 8.50.</i>	4	16%
1b	Torri cyflogaeth goruchwyllo gan drefnu gwirfoddolwyr (ond dim yn y gegin)  <i>Cut employment of supervisors and arrange volunteers.(but not in the kitchen)</i>	0	

2	Corff Llywodraethol yn tynnu allan o'r Cynllun GAN  <i>Governing Body pulling out of the scheme AND</i>		
2a	Ymuno gyda Clwb Bore Bach  <i>Join the Clwb Bore Bach</i>	7	<b>28%</b>
2b	Trefnu cynllun eich hunain gan dderbyn cyllid datganoledig  <i>Arrange your own scheme by receiving delegated finance</i>	0	
3	Rhedeg clwb gofal rhwng 8.00 a 8.30 gan godi 75c ar bawb. Yna Clwb Brecwast am 8.30 i 8.50 am ddim. Defnyddio staff presennol ar y telerau presennol. Gall rhieni danfon eu plant i'r clwb brecwat erbyn 8.30 yn unig.  <i>Run a care club between 8.00 and 8.30 at a fee of 75p for all children. Then a Free Breakfast Club from 8.30 to 8.50. Use present staff at the present conditions. Parents can send their children to the breakfast club by 8.30 only.</i>	10	<b>40%</b>

### **Sylwadau / Comments**

#### **Opsion 1 Option.**

##### **Opsion 1a Option**

- Pwy sydd yn hysbysu staff?
- A fydd cytundebau newydd?
- Colli cyflogaeth
  
- *Who to inform staff?*
- *Will there be new contracts?*
- *Loss of employment*

### **Opsiwn 1b Option**

- Ni ellir dibynnu ar wirfoddolwyr
- *One cannot rely on volunteers*

### **Opsiwn 2a Option**

- Pryderon am gasglu arian man a gweinyddu'r cynllun.
- Teuluoedd gyda dyledion
- Cymhareb staff / disgyblion.
- Gall yr ysgol dynnu allan yn y dyfodol e.e. adolygu ymhen blwyddyn?
- *Concerns regarding collecting money and administering the scheme*
- *Families with debts*
- *Staff / pupil ratio*
- *Can the school pull out in the future e.g. review in a year?*

### **Opsiwn 2b Option**

### **Opsiwn 3 Option**

- Pwy sydd yn cadw'r 75c?
- Pwy sydd yn rhedeg y clwb - ysgol ynteu Awdurdod?
- Angen clwb gofal tan 8.50 i osgoi anawsterau goruchwyllo.
- Effaith 75c y dydd ar rai teuluoedd
- Eraill o'r farn fod 75c yn rhad
- Cadw 75c am 3 blynedd i roi sicrwydd
- Gosod amser pendant i rieni
- Pwy cyllido'r gweinyddu?
- *Who keeps the 75p?*
- *Who runs the club – school or Authority?*
- *Need for the care club to run until 8.50 to avoid supervision problems*
- *Effect of 75p on some families*
- *Others of the opinion that 75p is cheap*
- *Keep 75p for 3 years to give stability*
- *Place definite times for parents*
- *Who to finance the administration?*

### **Cyffredinol / General**

- Angen dewis opsiwn gyda'r gefnogaeth fwyaf gan yr Awdurdod.
- Pryd y daw unrhyw newidiadau i rym?
- Angen i ysgolion symud fel un
- Adolygiadau rheolaidd
- Sir i benderfynnu

- *Need to choose the option with the greatest support from the Authority*
- *When do any changes come into force?*
- *Need for schools to move as one*
- *Regular reviews*
- *Council to decide*